

AGREED FINAL ORDER

In order to conclude this matter, Melvin Harvey Godbold neither admits nor denies the truth of the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law contained herein and further agrees to the disciplinary action set out in this Agreed Final Order. The Board makes the following findings of fact and conclusions of law and enters this Order in accordance with Tex. Occ. CODE § 1103.458:

FINDINGS OF FACT

- Respondent Melvin Harvey Godbold is a Texas state certified residential real estate appraiser, holds certification number TX-1323112-R, and has been certified by the Board during all times material to the above-noted complaint case.
- 2. On or about February 16th, 2006, Respondent appraised real property located at 9605 Dulcimer Street, Houston, Texas 77051 ("the property").
- 3. On or about April 5th, 2007, the Complainant, Trina Goudeau, filed a complaint with the Board. The complaint alleged that the appraisal report was performed incorrectly and had errors leading to overvaluation.
- 4. On or about June 1st, 2007 the Board, in accordance with the mandate of the Administrative Procedure Act (the APA), TEX. GOVT CODE ANN. CHPT. 2001, and TEX. Occ. CODE CHPT. 1103, notified Respondent of the nature of the accusations involved and Respondent was afforded an opportunity to respond to the accusations in the complaint. Respondent's response to the complaint was received.
- 5. Respondent violated Tex. Occ. Cope § 1103.405, 22 Tex. ADMIN. Cope §§ 153.20(a)(3) and 155.1(a) by the following acts or omissions which did not conform to USPAP in effect at the time of the appraisal report for the property
 - Respondent failed to identify and report the site description by failing to report the existence of an Exxon pipeline located roughly 60 feet from the property and analyze any effect on value the pipeline's presence had;

- b) Respondent falled to identify and report the improvement(s)-description adequately due to the fallure to report several items that weter not completed or installed (such as the lack of any installed air conditioning condenser, lack of water healer vent pipe connection, the lack of an electric mere or any electrical supply connection, the lack of attic insulation etc.);
- Respondent failed to provide a brief summary of his rationale for his determination of the property's highest and best use;
- Respondent failed to explain and support his exclusion of the cost approach despite the fact that the property was built in 2005 and had just been completely renovated;
- Respondent failed to collect, verify, analyze and reconcile sales comparison data properly and generally did not employ recognized methods and techniques;
- f) Respondent failed to correctly report the listing history of the property;
- g) Respondent failed to analyze and report three prior sales of the property within the three year period prior to the date of his appraisal report;
- Respondent failed to reconcile the quality and quantity of the data within the approaches used and the applicability or suitability of the approaches;
- Respondent was negligent in failing to report and analyze the prior sales history
 of the property, failing to report and analyze several sales comparables within
 the property's immediate neighborhood, and failing to accurately report the
 condition of the property;
- Respondent's report for the property contains substantial errors of commission or omission as detailed above which resulted in a misleading appraisal report for the property.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Act, Tex. Occ. Code § 1103 et. seq.
- 2. Respondent violated the following provisions of USPAP as prohibited by 22 Tex. ADMIN. CODE §§ 155.1(a) and 153.20(a)(3): USPAP Standards Rules: 1-2(e)(i) & 2-2(b)(iii); 1-3(b) & 2-2(b)(x); 2-2(b)(xi); 1-4(a) & 2-2(b)(ix); 1-1(a) & 1-4(a); 1-5(a) & 2-2(b)(1x); 1-5(b) & 2-2(b)(ix); 1-6(a) & 1-6(b) & 2-2(b)(ix); 1-1(a); 1-1(b), 1-1(c); and, 2-1(a).
- 3. Respondent violated 22 Tex. ADMIN. CODE §153.20(a)(9) by making material misrepresentations and omitting material facts.

Based on the above findings of fact and conclusions of law, the Board ORDERS that the Respondent shall:

- Attend and complete a minimum, 15 classroom-hour course in USPAP;
- Attend and complete a minimum, 15 classroom-hour course in Residential Case Studies;
- Pay to the Board an administrative penalty of \$250.00, the payment of which
 is hereby probated under the condition that Respondent comply with all other
 terms of this Agreed Final Order; and,
- d. Comply with all provisions of the Act, the Rules of the Board, and USPAP in the future, or be subjected to further disciplinary action.

ALL CLASSES required by this Agreed Final Order must be classes approved by the Board and must be completed within TWELVE MONTHS of the date of this Order and documentation of attendance and successful completion of the educational requirements of this Order shall be delivered to the Board on or before the end of the twelve-month period indicated. None of the classes or seminars required by this Order may be taken through correspondence courses. Unless otherwise noted above, all classes must be in-class, have an exam, and Respondent must have a passing grade on the exam given in each class. None of these required classes will count toward Respondent's continuing education requirements for certification.

Failure to timely comply with any of the terms of this Final Agreed Order shall result in initiation of a contested case proceeding against Respondent and after opportunity for a hearing, possible imposition of disciplinary sanctions against Respondent as provided for by Tex. Occ. Code § 1103.518.

Respondent, by signing this Agreed Final Order, walves the Respondent's right to a formal hearing and any right to seek judicial review of this Agreed Final Order. Information about this Agreed Final Order is subject to public information requests and notice of this Agreed Final Order will be published in the Board's newsletter and/or on the Board's web site.

THE DATE OF THIS AGREED FINAL ORDER shall be the date it is executed by the Chairperson of the Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board. The Chairperson has been delegated the authority to sign this Agreed Final Order by the Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board vote.

Signed this 19th day of September 2008.

MELVIN HARVEY GODBOLD

| SWORN TO AND SUBSCRIBED BEFORE ME, 1 SEPTEMBER , 2008, by MELVIN HARVEY | the undersigned, on this the 1% day of GODBOLD, to certify which, witness my |
|--|---|
| hand and official seal. | CA MARRONIA |
| Notable Public Signature | * of the second |
| Notary Public's Printed Name | 72-12-09 Market |
| A | - ATTENDED |
| Signed by the Commissioner thisday of | OCTOBER, 2008. |
| | |
| Timothy K. Irvine, Commissioner | |
| Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Box | ırd |
| Approved by the Board and Signed this da | y of <u>OCNBER</u> , 2008. |
| and for | |
| Clinton P. Sayers, Chairperson | l |
| Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Boa | lta |

| TEXAS APPRAISER LICENSING AND CERTIFICATION BOARD | <i>\$</i> | |
|---|-----------|-------------------------------|
| vs. | 9999 | DOCKETED COMPLAINT NO. 07-128 |
| MELVIN HARVEY GODBOLD TX-1323112-R | § § | |

FINAL ORDER

On this/6/4 day of 6/2009, the Board considered the above-noted matter, in which an Agreed Final Order was previously entered by the Board.

The Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board, after review and due consideration of Respondent's request for modification of the previously entered Agreed Final Order, attached as Exhibit A hereto, now enters this Final Order modifying the previously entered Agreed Final Order.

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED by the Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board that Melvin Harvey Godbold is granted an extension of Mouton days to satisfy the remedial education requirements contained in the Agreed Final Order.

Approved by the Board and Signed this 16th day of October, 2009

Clinton P. Sayers, Chairperson

Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board